RIPE Policy Proposal 2014-05

Policy for Inter-RIR Transfers of Internet Resources

Andrea Cima
RIPE NCC

"This policy proposal describes the transfer of Internet number resources between a resource holder within the RIPE NCC service region and a resource holder within the region of another RIR"

- Published on 18 May 2014

  - Presented during RIPE 68

- General framework for inter-RIR transfers

  - For all Internet number resources covered by intra-RIR transfer policy

- RIPE NCC to fulfil any requirements of the sending RIR

First Version - Mailing List Discussion

- Support for the intent of the policy proposal

  - 19 postings by 10 people

- Request for wording improvements

  - Clarification of terms such as "LIR" and "resource holder"

- Suggestion to remove references to Legacy from the proposed IPv4 policy document

  - Address legacy resources transfer in a separate document

RIPE
NCC

Second Version

- Published on 13 October 2014
    - RIPE NCC Impact Analysis published on the same date

- Main differences from the first version
    - Replaced the term "LIR" with "resource holder"
    - Removed the reference to legacy resources from the "*IPv4 Address Allocation and Assignment Policies for the RIPE NCC Service Region*" policy document

RIPE NCC

- RIPE NCC's understanding

  - Proposed policy would apply to IPv4 PA allocations, IPv4 PI assignments and legacy resources

  - Resources transferred to the RIPE region cannot be re-transferred for 24 months

- Policy compatibility with other RIRs

  - *"After consulting with both ARIN and APNIC, the two RIRs have confirmed how ARIN policy requires 'needs based', explicitly stated, policy principals to be in place to allow for inter-RIR resource transfers, and that APNIC's has the same needs based principles explicitly stated in its policy document"*

RIPE
NCC

- Compatibility with ARIN policy

  "ARIN staff notes that the lack of a specific needs-based requirement in the RIPE policy document will prevent the policy from being deemed compatible with ARIN's Inter-RIR transfer policy requirements to the RIPE region (although its adoption will have no effect on Inter-RIR transfers between ARIN and the APNIC region.)"

RIPE
NCC

- Compatibility with APNIC policy

  "RIPE policy document ripe-622 (paragraph 5.1, sub 3), addresses a needs base in an implicit manner. It is therefore not possible for the APNIC secretariat to interpret this and take a position. APNIC secretariat indicates that it will consult their community in order to get guidance on how to proceed"

- Continued support for the intent of the policy proposal

  - 31 postings by 11 people

- Focus on how to adjust policy to achieve compatibility with the other RIRs' required needs based principles

Third Version

- Published on 16 January 2015

  - RIPE NCC Impact Analysis published on the same date

- Establish compatibility with ARIN and APNIC policies

  - Introduction of need justification for transfers from RIR regions that require the receiving region to have needs-based policies

    - Recipient must plan for the use of at least 50% of the transferred resources within five years

    - Addressing plan evaluated by the RIPE NCC

- RIPE NCC's understanding

    - Resources being transferred would remain subject to the policies of the sending RIR until the transfer is completed

    - Receiving IP transfers only if the network that will be using them has at least one active element located in the RIPE NCC service region

RIPE NCC

- Compatibility with ARIN and APNIC policy

"Both RIRs have since confirmed that the proposed policy is compatible with their Inter-RIR transfer policies. The modified proposal meets the "needs based" requirement that is explicitly stated in ARIN's policy. APNIC will hold a public consultation at the APNIC 39 Policy SIG, after which it will advise if there are any remaining areas of concern"

RIPE
NCC

- Overall participation 60 postings by 21 people

- Proposal received only support, no opposition

- Policy proposals for allowing also IPv6 and ASN transfers are currently being discussed

- Address Policy WG Chairs declared rough consensus; policy proposal to enter Last Call phase on 5 March 2015

RIPE
NCC

RIPE
NCC