APNIC 30 Member Meeting Minutes

Chair:

Akinori Maemura, Chair, Executive Council of APNIC

Agenda:

1. Welcome – Paul Wilson
2. APNIC Secretariat report – Paul Wilson
3. APNIC Services Area report – Sanjaya
4. APNIC Technical Area report – Byron Ellacott
5. APNIC Communications Area report – German Valdez
6. APNC Business Area Report – Richard Brown
7. APNIC EC election procedure and speeches from candidates – Akinori Maemura
8. Executive Council report – Akinori Maemura
9. Treasurer's report: James Spenceley
10. Policy SIG report – Gaurab Raj Upadhaya
11. NIR SIG report – Izumi Okutani
12. Member Petition BoF report – James Spenceley
13. NRO report – Axel Pawlik
14. NRO Statistics report – Guangliang Pan
15. Address Council report - Tomohiro Fujisaki
16. IANA report – Elise Gerich
17. RIR reports
18. NRO NC election result
19. APNIC 31 launch – Che-Hoo Cheng
20. Thanks and closing

1. Welcome

Presenter: Akinori Maemura

Akinori Maemura, Chair of the APNIC EC, welcomed the Members to the AMM. He continues to be the Chair for the AMM as per the APNIC By-laws.

2. APNIC Secretariat report

Presenter: Paul Wilson, Director General of APNIC

Paul Wilson started by recommending that participants fill out a Meeting survey form and provide feedback that will enable APNIC to improve its Meetings.

Paul summarized key achievements of the 2010 Operational Plan and elaborated that the Operational Plan is based on the results of the Member and Stakeholder Survey and informs Budgetary and activity planning.

Under Delivering Value, Paul stressed the importance of RQA, particularly with impending IPv4 exhaustion. Lowering the barriers for getting IPv6 and the extension of Helpdesk hours

is also a key achievement in Delivering Value as is security and robustness, DNSSEC, Training improvements, Resource Certification, and high availability.

 Supporting Internet Development focuses on IPv6 deployment through proactive outreach and attendance at many meetings. APNIC has also deployed many anycast rootservers, and engaged in TTM, to report and share on the Internet's performance activity.

A core part of Collaborating and Communicating is APNIC's involvement in Internet Governance activities. Paul noted that although this is an overhead for APNIC, our success in this arena is demonstrable. We also have a new Senior Public Affairs Advisor to assist APNIC in this area. APNIC is also coordinating with the NRO on a number of activities, including staff exchanges and the development and delivery of services.

As for Corporate Support, APNIC is committed to diversity, performance appraisal, remuneration, and adequate health and safety.

APNIC is also conducting the next online Member and Stakeholder Survey in October 2010, facilitated by Professor Ang Peng Hwa, Nanyang Technological University.

3. Services Area report

Presenter: Sanjaya, Services Director

Under Delivering Value, Services have been focused on RQA activity, by doing more outreach, reachability testing, and experimentation conducted in collaboration with many organizations. MyAPNIC's interface has also been improved with new features, including whois and support for the transfer policy implementation. DNSSEC updates in MyAPNIC will provide a feature for Members to update their DNS with their DS record. Kickstart IPv6 has had 403 applications since the policy was implemented in Feb 2010. Membership applications for IPv6 have also been streamlined. Helpdesk hours have increased to 21:00.

Supporting Internet Development includes the implementation of the new abuse contact policy in November and TTM and root server deployment.

In terms of service levels, APNIC now has 2,132 account holders, with Helpdesk growing over 12% in the last year.

After this presentation, Naresh Ajwani (CCAOI) reported that the Indian government has mandated the compulsory implementation of IPv6 by all service providers by December 2011.

4. Technical Area report

Presenter: Byron Ellacott, Technical Director

Under Delivering Value, APNIC is ensuring that the same level of service is being provided for both IPv4 and IPv6 in terms of reliability and robustness. Updated information regarding this is available on ICONS.

With Supporting Internet Development, APNIC is rolling out phase 3 of DNSSEC, by providing support for DS records and enabling anycast for the DNS servers.

Through Collaboration and Communicating, APNIC has been working with the NRO and the IETF on a global RPKI system. All the RIRs have now produced signed objects that can be validated by third party tools.

Under Corporate Support, the Software Team is adopting agile methodology, well proven for delivering software that more closely matches expectations. APNIC is also working towards having triangle architecture in terms of site redundancy, with two co-location facilities, including the APNIC offices. This will give us a greater degree of resilience for our network services.

Other highlights include the work of the R&D team, which has been measuring the background radiation of toxic blocks so that APNIC can understand some of the activity on the Internet.

5. Communications Area report

Presenter: German Valdez, Communications Director

Delivering Value centres on improving training content and delivery, including the successful implementation of eLearning. In terms of Policy, prop-080 and prop-082 have been implemented and prop-079 will be implemented in November 2010. The last APNIC Meeting in KL attracted 753 participants, 123 of those, APNIC Members.

In Supporting Internet Development, during APNIC 29, APNIC was also elected to serve as the Secretariat of the Asia Pacific IPv6 Task Force, with Tony Hill, the Chair. APNIC also worked closely with the APEC TEL WG on two IPv6 workshops. In terms of Internet Governance activities, APNIC waws one of the main organizers and sponsors of the first Asia Pacific IGF in Hong Kong and we will continue to build on that regional activity by co-hosting remote hubs in the region for the IGF in Vilnius.

Through Collaboration and Communication, APNIC is continuing with its multi-stakeholder approach with IPv6, participating in many forums.

6. Business Area report

Presenter: Richard Brown, Business Area Director

Under Delivering Value, APNIC successfully implemented the new fee schedule with 75% of our Members billed under the new schedule. The new Non-Member fee schedule will be implemented from 1 January 2011. APNIC is also pleased to advise that APNIC's status as a not-for-profit mutual organization via our private ruling was upheld by the ATO.

Corporate Support included implementation of the 2010 Operational Plan, new building activities and HR Strategy. APNIC continues to focus on hiring skilled specialists from a diverse background, and have recently commenced an internship program allowing foreign graduates an opportunity to gain work experience. Continuous improvement is a core feature in APNIC's HR strategy and filters down to individual key performance indicators. There is increased use of in-house and online group training, and APNIC has ensured that APNIC Trainers and Internet Resource Analysts have a formal certification in Training composition and delivery.

APNIC is also looking at new systems for finance and payroll, expenses, and travel management.

7. NRO NC Election

Presenter: Akinori Maemura, Chair of the EC

Akinori Maemura made the point that the NRO NC election is a community election where Members and individuals have equal voting rights. The election is still held according to best practice and relevant By-laws if necessary. The NRO NC is made up of 15 members, three from each region. The Board of each RIR selects one of those members. The new Election Review Panel Report (ERP) provides guidelines on the NRO NC election that were adopted for this election. It includes that the Chair of the EC will:

- Serve as the Chair of the Election
- Oversee the responsibilities of the election process
- Handle complaints
- Resolve disputes

An ERP addition also included the election Chair selecting tellers (vote counters) and scrutineers (who observe tellers and notify of any election anomalies or issues).

Paul Wilson did mention that there was an issue regarding the handling of the ballot box, in that a vote was entered before the box was opened for voting. That vote was returned to the owner and the ballot box was closed.

The candidates then gave their speeches.

8. Executive Council report

Presenter: Akinori Maemura, Chairman, EC

Akinori Maemura pointed out that the format for listing EC members has changed, with the name of the member, their country, location, the number of terms, and term expiration now being supplied.

Kuo-Wei Wu resigned from the EC following his appointment to ICANN. His position, according to the By-laws, will remain vacant until APNIC 31.

Akinori outlined the functions of the EC and pointed out that an NRO EC observer from each RIR Board has been appointed, with that function going to Akinori.

The main focus for the EC has been the review of the election process, ongoing India NIR negotiations, APNIC's taxation status, and the progress of the new building.

9. Executive Council Treasurer's report

Presenter: James Spenceley, Treasurer, EC

A key highlight for 2010 was the implementation of the new fee schedule that came into force on 1 January and was applied to all new Members and existing Members who renewed their membership after that date. Membership growth has seen an increase of 8% with 2,318 Members as at 30 June 2010. Total revenue is budgeted at AUD 12.8 million, expenditure at AUD 13.17 million, with an expected loss of around AUD 200,000.

10. Policy SIG report

Presenter: Gaurab Raj Upadhayai, SIG Chair

Four proposals were discussed (props 084; 085; 086; 087). Prop-084: Frequent whois information update request; prop-085: Eligibility for critical infrastructure assignments from the final /8; prop-087: IPv6 address allocation for deployment purposes; and prop-086: global policy for IPv4 allocations by IANA post-exhaustion were all returned to the mailing list. Prop-084: Alternative criteria for subsequent IPv6 allocation was also returned to the mailing list for further discussion. The author will rewrite the proposal and present it at APNIC 31.

11. NIR SIG report

Presenter: Izumi Okutani, NIR SIG Chair

A new Co-Chair was elected, Ji-Young Lee from KRNIC. The participating NIRS – CNNIC, TWNIC, and KRNIC outlined their efforts to deploy IPv6, including measurement of IPv6 readiness (TWNIC), and recommendations for peering (KISA). CNNIC reported that there were more than 73 allocations of IPv6 as a result of prop-073: Simplifying allocation/assignment of IPv6. Izumi reminded participants that the ICONS wiki is available to share and exchange information about IPv6 deployment measures.

12. Membership Petition BoF

Presenter: James Spenceley

The first Petition concerned "One vote per Member" on the basis that it is more democratic. Concerns from the floor raised the issues surrounding voting availability for an "Associate Member" who has no resources, and "NIR Members" who have a lot of resources and may have hundreds of sub-Members, but who still only have one vote. The participants elected to set up a working group. The Chairs selected to facilitate are: Kenny Huang (TWNIC); and Desi Valli, (Net4, India).

The second Petition concerned formation of a Government Advisory Council. There was a balanced response from participants, generally supportive of promoting the involvement of Government. A working group will be set up to further discuss this. The Chairs elected to facilitate are: Naveen Tandon (AT&T (India)); and Shayam Nair (Sify Technologies Ltd).

Petition three concerned a limit for EC terms, but the Petition lacked disadvantages limiting the EC member's terms, and there was the implication that longer-term EC members may misappropriate assets. The participants supported dropping the proposal.

S P Jerath (Tulip Telecom Ltd), the author of the Petition, commented that he did not have the time to fully elaborate on his Petition and that it was undemocratic.

James Spenceley confirmed that there is no reason why this cannot be rewritten and resubmitted and this was later echoed by Naresh Ajwani (CCAOI), after further comment by Pavan Duggal (Cyberlaw Asia), that S P Jerath had "natural justice" denied to him, as he was not able to fully articulate his proposal.

13. Number Resource Organization (NRO) Report

Presenter: Axel Pawlik, Chair, NRO Executive Council

The Number Resource Organization (NRO) is the vehicle through which the RIRs undertake mutual cooperative and representative activities. One thing that the NRO shares is a range of expenses incurred by the RIRs, such as the annual contribution made to ICANN.

With approaching IPv4 exhaustion, the NRO wants to raise its profile with ICANN and continues to focus on Internet Governance and ITU activities.

14. NRO Statistics report

Presenter: Guangliang Pan, Resource Services Manager, APNIC

This report outlines Internet number resource stats for the 5 RIRs. As of August 2010, only 14 /8 blocks of IPv4 addresses remain in IANA. It is expected that IPv4 will run out sometime in 2011. APNIC continues to allocate more IPv4 addresses than any other region, allocating more than 3 /8 blocks in the first 6 months of 2010.

IPv6 allocations continue to grow, and APNIC have allocated nearly 300 so far in 2010.

This year, APNIC has assigned about 2,300 AS numbers, significantly higher than the usual 600 to 700 normally assigned.

15. ASO report

Presenter: Tomohiro Fujisaki

The ASO's responsibility is to advise the ICANN Board and select two ICANN Board Members and one NC Member. It comprises 15 Members (3 from each region); with terms of appointment of 2 years for elected Members and 1 year for appointed Members. This year, Kuo-Wei Wu was elected to the ICANN Board. The ASO is focused on improving the procedure for Board elections. The procedure is tightly defined and the operational document is currently being reviewed.

The ASO is presently managing three global policies. Two are being discussed (Global policy for allocation of ASNs to RIRS; Global policy for IPv4 allocation by IANA post-exhaustion);

and one failed to reach consensus (Global proposal for the allocation IPv4 blocks to the RIRs)

16. IANA report

Presenter: Elise Gerich

IANA has updated their whois server and now provides responses for unicast IP addresses, multicast registrations, AS numbers, and DS records. They have also launched international domain names so you can now have a domain name in non-ASCII characters. Another big activity that IANA has undertaken, along with the international Internet community, is DNSSEC deployment at the root. There are now 17 top-level domains that have a chain of trust from the root to those top-level domains, for example, Sri Lanka.

Global policy (prop-074) is currently in the comment period and the ICANN Board will make its decision by 20 September.

Twelve /8s have been allocated in 2010, with six allocated to APNIC. IANA has 14 /8s left unallocated.

In multicast news, there is a draft IETF ruling that everyone with a /24 of IPv4 unicast space also has a multicast of /32 using a 234/8 algorithmic assignment mechanism. IANA will also be introducing an annual review process for multicast address assignments.

17. RIR reports

(a) Presenter: Leslie Nobile, ARIN

ARIN is continuing with development and integration of ARIN online, its new web-based system. There has been continued focus on IPv6 outreach and enhancement of RPKI in line with the other RIRS. ARIN will be rolling out new DNSSEC production services at the end of 2010. The whois point of contact (POC) validation process with direct resources is now automated with a 33% response rate, compared to the manual 5% response rate. Seven policies will be discussed at the next ARIN meeting.

(b) Presenter: Arturo Servin, LACNIC

From a strategic point of view, LACNIC is focusing on customer-oriented projects, including working with Government. They are also working on global RPKI, DNSSEC deployment, and IPv6 deployment outreach. LACNIC also utilizes a quality assurance program, and continues to be involved in AMPRO and FRIDA projects.

(c) Presenter: Axel Pawlik, RIPE NCC

RIPE implemented electronic voting for its Board elections, outsourcing the entire system. They have also implemented a "Reclamation project" and have increased the frequency of audits in how Members are using the resources. RIPE labs will also be re-launched to get a better understanding of the community's needs before implementation of large systems. RIPE's measurement activities will also be modified with the objective being to reach each AS in each major city. IPv6 deployment and participation in IGF and ITU activities continues to dominate RIPE's outreach activities.

(d) Presenter: Paul Wilson for Adiel Akplogan, AfriNIC

AfriNIC currently has over 600 Members and has focused attention on integrating a new Member portal, MyAfrinic, working with the other RIRs on DNSSEC and implementing test beds, and testing of RPKI deployments. The biggest challenge facing AfriNIC currently is human resources and they are recruiting now.

18. NRO NC voting result

The results of the NRO NC election were: Total votes – 269, with only 1 invalid vote. Naresh Ajwani received 156 votes; Jonny Martin, 108 votes; Tony Sampano, 4 votes; and Hasanul Haque, 0 votes.

During the RIR reports, Farhad Al Shirawi, a scrutineer, questioned the validity of some of the votes, in that there were six votes cast using four certificates. This technical aspect of MyAPNIC is a valid use in that it is possible for multiple votes to be cast using one certificate, as it is common to have one consultant having access to different Member accounts using different user IDs and certificates. Pavan Duggal (Cyberlaw Asia) cautioned that the Chair should not have adjudicated on this issue, but Farhad responded that the scrutineers, in fact, were the adjudicators and assessed that after hearing the explanation on how MyAPNIC worked, there was no question of voting invalidity.

19. APNIC 31 launch

Presenter: Che-Hoo Cheng, The Chinese University of Hong Kong, APNIC EC member

APNIC 31 will be held in Hong Kong SAR, China from 21 - 25 February 2011, in conjunction with APRICOT 2011 and APAN 31.

20. Thanks and closing

Paul Wilson ended the Meeting by announcing that APNIC 32 will be held in Busan, South Korea, generously hosted by KRNIC KISA. APNIC 30 ended at 16:30 with a vote of thanks to all the sponsors and to all those who participated in making it such a successful event.